



## From Theory to *Action*, Concert Programming Strategies:

### Clara Wieck-Schumann's Piano Sonata in G minor (1841-42)

Ning Hui See | Royal College of Music London (Natasha Loges, Rosie Perkins, Danny Driver)



# ENTIRE SEASON

(ENSEMBLES WITH FOCUS ON HISTORICAL AND NEW MUSIC)



Gender and the Musical Canon

Marcia Citron, 1993

Women & Music: A History

Karin Pendle, 1991

PROGRAMS FOR  
UNDERREPRESENTED  
HERITAGES  
15-25%

**Coherence** in Concert

Programming: A View from the **U.K.**'

Mark Gotham, 2014

**'Challenging** the Listener: How to

**Change** Trends in Classical Music

Programming'

Miguel Marín, 2018

LIVING  
COMPOSERS  
25-35%

# Autoethnography

	<p>I briefly considered playing the first movement (standalone) of Schumann's <i>Fantasia</i>, Op. 17 instead, which would have drawn attention to the romantic nature of both his <i>Fantasia</i> and her Sonata. However, since I have made a very similar 'romantic' connection using the juxtaposition of the two Sonatas and wanted to avoid the 'couple' concept fixation, decided to go for an Austro-German theme with the concept of tradition and virtuosity in 19<sup>th</sup>-century pianism.</p>	
Contrast  Advocacy Concept and coherence	<p>With the final programme design, each piece has a different genre and textural presence: I see the Bach-Liszt as more architectural in its construction (from the ground up, brick by brick, or from one cell to a larger entity). Wieck-Schumann's Sonata is the most discursive and personal work, like a long journey or narrative. Schumann's set of Variations is more 'static' in that it does not attempt to 'build', but explores, and is colouristic/symphonic. This programme would allow the Sonata to stand out, having the most colourful thematic and emotional range. At the same time, it makes stylistic connections and has a secondary theme of tradition and virtuosity in the 19<sup>th</sup>-century, the idea of paying homage, and the Bach and Beethoven influence over 19<sup>th</sup>-century pianism.</p>	Want it to stand out as the 'special work' but also don't want to overstate it
	<h3>Sequencing</h3> <p>Since it's a lunchtime recital without intermission, it was a decision between placing the Sonata last or in the middle. I'd never place it as the first work, as it feels unsettling to start with a multi-movement Sonata. I realise as I was writing this that I had, in fact, placed Beethoven's Op. 90 Sonata as the first work at St Paul's Knightsbridge in 2019, and that turned out well. But Beethoven's Op. 90 is a smaller work (two movements, 14-15 mins) and starts with two very 'arresting' chords. In comparison, Wieck-Schumann's Sonata emerges with a more mysterious first subject at a quieter dynamic level, which I find musically and physically awkward to start with. (The physical awkwardness is directly related to the musical awkwardness or one and the same.)</p>	Audience engagement – how it starts is important  Gesture, physicality, sound
Communication  Musical value	<p>I like the way the Bach-Liszt Prelude begins with just the right hand and unravels in an improvisatory way as the textures gradually expand, which seems an 'inviting' way to begin a programme. I briefly entertained placing the Sonata last since it does 'end with a bang', which I used to care for. I ultimately decided to place the Sonata in the middle rather than at the end, for a couple of reasons: 1) I considered the ICD's suggestion of placing an unfamiliar work as the second as that is presumably when our listening attention span peaks, 2) I think it's important how the very first phrase is perceived, that it draws you into the work. I feel that the subdued/mysterious character of the exposition of the Sonata's first movement would be more effective after the towering density and commanding final cadence of the fugue, rather than after the concluding Etude B3, which is somewhat elusive and ethereal. In general, I also find that theme and variations is a genre that is easier to listen to, relying predominantly on timbral explorations, unlike a sonata with richer motivic material and complex structural organisation.</p>	How sound builds  Awareness of audience's experience/perspective  Prioritising the less familiar work in my sequencing decision

# Research Questions

How do the internal meaning-making processes of performers feed into external performances?

- How does the performer's *attitude* towards Wieck-Schumann's Sonata influence their *decisions* towards concert programming and repertoire selection?
- How does the performer's phenomenological *experience* of playing and presenting Wieck-Schumann's Sonata evolve as a result of the programme design and surrounding works?
- How do we build long-term commitment with the work?

'the work of a woman';  
'feminine sentimentality'

(Wieck-Schumann on her own Trio, *after* Schumann wrote his)

COMPOSER

PERFORMER PEDAGOGUE EDITOR

Clara Wieck-Schumann (1819-

GENDER CLASS FAMILY NATIONALITY

Marie Pleyel (1811-1875)

Fanny Hensel (1805-1847)

Louise Farrenc (1804-1875)





Nationalism  
Essentialism

Biology>intellect

1890s-1920s

Litzmann, 1902-08  
Florence May, 1912  
Grove, 1894

Second-wave feminism

Women's names

1920s-60s  
1960s-70s

MGG (Fellinger), 1965  
Süsskind, 1977

*'a central figure in her own life'*

- Nancy Reich, 1985

Sociology> Musicology

Women's lives

1980s

Chissell, 1983  
Reich, 1985

Third-wave feminism

Women's works

1990s

Klassen, 1991  
de Vries, 1996  
Cooper, 1996  
Pendle, 1991  
Solie, 1993  
Citron, 1993

Sonata published

1996 centenary

Balance, broader view

Transforming repertoire canon

Theory >> Action

2000s-?

Klassen, 2009  
Selmon, 2010  
Borchard, 2019  
Grove (Loges), 2021  
Davies, 2022

2019 bicentenary

Bach, Mozart, Beethoven

Lieder, literature

Clara **Wieck-Schumann** **Piano Sonata (1841-42)**

daughter, wife

prodigy, artist

‘masculine’

‘intellectual’

‘transcendental’

virtuosity?




1989 premiere

1991 publication

First movement quotation: Er ist gekommen in Sturm und Regen

Fourth movement resemblance to Sie liebten sich beide

# 4 Concert Programmes with Clara Schumann's Sonata


Austro-German	'Add-and-stir' canonical	All-women composers	Clara Schumann's Theme
19 <sup>th</sup> -century pianism	Contrast, familiarity	Intersectionality, identity	Romanticism, biographical
 <p><b>Nationalism</b> <b>Essentialism</b> Biology&gt;intellect 1890s-1920s</p> <p>Litzmann, 1902-08 Florence May, 1912 * Grove, 1894</p>	 <p><b>Third-wave feminism</b> Women's works 1920s-60s 1990s</p> <p>Klassen, 1991 * de Vries, 1996 Cooper, 1996 Pendle, 1991 Solie, 1993 Citron, 1993</p>	 <p><b>Sociology&gt; Musicology</b> Women's lives 1980s</p> <p>Chissell, 1983 Reich, 1985 *</p> <p><i>in her own life'</i> ancy Reich, 1985</p>	 <p><b>Balance, broader v Transforming repe</b> Theory &gt;&gt; Action 2000s-?</p> <p>Klassen, 2009 Selmon, 2010 * Borchard, 2019 Grove (Loges), 2021 Davies, 2022</p>
			<p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <i>Romance variée</i>, Op. 3 (origin of the motif)</p> <p>*spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Robert Schumann:</u> Fantasie in C, Op. 17, first movement</p> <p>*spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Brahms:</u> Intermezzo No. 4 in E Major, Op. 116</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p>



# 4 Concert Programmes with Clara Schumann's Sonata

Austro-German	'Add-and-stir' canonical	All-women composers	Clara Schumann's Theme
19 <sup>th</sup> -century pianism			Romanticism, biographical
<p><u>Bach (transcr. Liszt):</u> Organ Prelude and Fugue in A minor, BWV 543</p> <p style="text-align: right;">*spoken intro*</p>			<p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <i>Romance variée</i>, Op. 3</p> <p><u>R. Schumann:</u> <i>Fantasie</i> in C, Op. 17, i. only</p> <p><u>Brahms:</u> Intermezzo No. 4 in E Major, Op. 116</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p>
<p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p> <p style="text-align: right;">*spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Robert Schumann:</u> Variations on a Theme by Beethoven, WoO 31</p>			<p>Schumann's 'three categories' of <u>evaluating</u> composers for the sonata were:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. the musician who wants to make his road to perfection more difficult with mental games</li> <li>2. the pianist who turns with talent to composition</li> <li>3. the artist, master of the form.</li> </ol> <p style="text-align: right;">- Gerd Nauhaus, Editor</p>

# 4 Concert Programmes with Clara Schumann's Sonata

Austro-German	'Add-and-stir' canonical	All-women composers	Clara Schumann's Theme
19 <sup>th</sup> -century pianism	Contrast, familiarity	Intersectionality, identity	Romanticism, biographical
<p><u>Bach (transcr. Liszt):</u> Organ Prelude and Fugue in A minor, BWV 543</p> <p>*spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p> <p>*spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Robert Schumann:</u> Variations on a Theme by Beethoven, WoO 31</p>	 <p><u>Third-wave feminism</u> <i>Women's works</i></p> <hr/> <p><u>1990s</u></p> <p>Klassen, 1991 de Vries, 1996 Cooper, 1996 <u>Pendle, 1991</u> <u>Solie, 1993*</u> <u>Citron, 1993</u></p>	<p><u>Amy Beach:</u> [Dreaming] 4 Sketches, Op. 15</p> <p><u>Fanny Hensel:</u> [June] Das Jahr</p> <p>*spoken intro = descriptive*</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p> <p>*spoken intro = musical, historical*</p> <p><u>Kaija Saariaho:</u> Prelude</p> <p><u>Florence Price:</u> Fantasie Nègre No. 2 G minor</p> <p>*spoken intro = ideological*</p> <p><u>Emily Koh:</u> reitario'</p> <p><u>Fanny Hensel:</u> [ July] Das Jahr</p>	<p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <i>Romance variée</i>, Op. 3</p> <p><u>R. Schumann:</u> Fantasie in C, Op. 17, i. only</p> <p><u>Brahms:</u> Intermezzo No. 4 in E Major, Op. 116</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p>

# 4 Concert Programmes with Clara Schumann's Sonata

Austro-German	'Add-and-stir'	All-women composers	Clara Schumann's Theme
19 <sup>th</sup> -century pianism	Contrast, familiarity	Intersectionality, identity	Romanticism, biographical
<p><u>Bach (transcr. Liszt):</u> Organ Prelude and Fugue in A minor, BWV 543 *spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor *spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Robert Schumann:</u> Variations on a Theme by Beethoven, WoO 31</p>	<p><u>Scarlatti:</u> Sonatas: k551 in B-flat major, k474 in E-flat major *spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor *spoken intro*</p> <p><u>Debussy:</u> Preludes: <i>Des pas sur la neige</i> and <i>Les collines d'Anacapri</i></p> <p><u>Rameau (transcr. Ólafsson):</u> The Arts and The Hours</p> <p><u>Phillip Glass:</u> Etude No. 6</p>	<p><u>Amy Beach:</u> [Dreaming] 4 Sketches, Op. 15</p> <p><u>Fanny Hensel:</u> [June] Das Jahr *spoken intro = descriptive*</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor *spoken intro = musical, historical*</p> <p><u>Kaija Saariaho:</u> Prelude Florence</p> <p><u>Price:</u> Fantasie Nègre No. 2 G minor *spoken intro = ideological*</p> <p><u>Emily Koh:</u> reitario'</p> <p><u>Fanny Hensel:</u> [ July] Das Jahr</p>	<p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <i>Romance variée</i>, Op. 3</p> <p><u>R. Schumann:</u> Fantasie in C, Op. 17, i. only</p> <p><u>Brahms:</u> Intermezzo No. 4 in E Major, Op. 116</p> <p><u>Wieck-Schumann:</u> <b>Sonata</b> in G minor</p>

# Autoethnography and Qualitative – self + **network**

<b>1. Autoethnography: Concert Programming</b>	<b>2. Qualitative Interviews: Pianists and Professors</b>	<b>Integrating 2 studies</b>
<p><u>Autoethnography:</u> Self in relation to others</p> <p><u>Phenomenology:</u> Experience</p>	<p>Reflexivity</p> <p>Semi-structured interviews, 1-1.5h</p> <p>Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA)</p>	<p>Broader patterns</p> <p>Towards the future</p>
<p><u>Stage1: Descriptive reflections</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Programming</li><li>2. Preparation</li><li>3. Performance</li><li>4. Reflection</li></ol> <p><u>Stage 2: Interpretative-analysis</u></p> <p><b>Themes</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Inductive coding</li><li>• Individual to group</li></ul>	<p><b>Open-ended ...</b></p> <p><b>?</b></p>





From Theory to *Action*, Concert Programming Strategies:  
**Clara Wieck-Schumann's Piano Sonata in G minor (1841-42)**

Ning Hui See, Doctoral Researcher, Royal College of Music London  
[Natasha Loges, Rosie Perkins, Danny Driver]

[Ning.See@rcm.ac.uk](mailto:Ning.See@rcm.ac.uk)